

		1	2	3	4	5						
		Least Advantageous	less advanatageous	Neutral	Advantageous	Most Advantageous						
								Elmwood School Site		Irvine (Hayden Rowe) Site		Todaro Site
ESBC 1/20/2015		1a	1a+25Ash	1b	1b+25Ash	1c	1c+25Ash	2a	2b	3a	3b	4a
Evaluation Criteria	Renovate all existing, build addition.	Renovate all existing, build addition, include 25 Ash Street property.	Keep Historic bldg only, new addition.	Keep Historic bldg only, new addition, include 25 Ash Street property.	New detached school. Keep Historic bldg only.	New detached school, include 25 Ash Street property. Keep Historic bldg only.	Building located in wooded area.	Building located in ball field area.	Building located to the North.	Building located to the South.	Todaro property only.	
GENERAL COMMENTS ON SITES	- All options require blasting and rock crushing which is very disruptive and would need to be accomplished in summer or school likely could not be held during blasting. - Without 25 Ash, options are significantly constrained on site and may require 3 story option to free up space. - Initial indications are license (not a property right) and would allow NSTAR to get it back. Also, NSTAR prefers roadway across NSTAR prop and parking in rear (not playfield).						- Public Safety officials have expressed concern over gas pipeline.					
Program Accommodation												5=open site capable of fully accomodating 4=constrained site 3=neutral
Costs (above baseline)	+2M temp facility costs	+4.5M Site acq + temp facility	+4M temp facility	+6M Site acq + temp facility	+1M temp facility	+3M Site acquisition	0	0	+2M site acquisition	+2M site acquisition	+2.5M site acquisition	-Does not include potential revenue offsets from selling portions of 25 Ash, or cost-of-community service savings/expense (see "Long range planning.") Costs to reno front and re-use rear of Center School included in 1a/1b. 1c includes demo of rear, but not reno of front (beyond patching up backside). - 2a, 2b, 3a, 3b, 4a do not include reno/demo costs for existing Center School building, or any benefits of having available space at vacated Center School.
Schedule	two phases - at least 30 months	two phases - at least 30 months	two phases - 26 months	two phases - 26 months	two phases - 24 months (demo/site package)	two phases - 24 months (demo/site package)	one phase 18 months	one phase 18 months	one phase 18 months	one phase 18 months	one phase 18 months	5=18 mos 3=24-26 mos 1=30 mos
Disruption to Education during construction	Phased construction with about half students located in adjacent modular complex. Without 25 Ash - very difficult and disruptive to manage construction access.	Same as 1a although 25 Ash property provides much more opportunity to manage construction access and flexibility to add play areas.	Same as 1a although whole school would need to be relocated to modular complex	Same as 1a +25 Ash although whole school would need to be relocated to modular complex	Large construction project ongoing next to existing school. Without 25 Ash - very difficult to manage construction traffic.	Large construction project ongoing next to existing school, space from separate construction access via 25 Ash	Large construction project ongoing next to existing school. Some disruption due to large construction project on site.	Large construction project ongoing next to existing school. Some disruption due to large construction project on site. Play areas compromised during construction.	None	None	None	Assumes Center School site blasting limited to Summer  5=no disruption 4=no relo, more space, dedicated constr access 3=no relo, but site crowded 2=half students relo 1=all students relo
Construction Impact to Neighbors	Site development will necessiate blasting of ledge. Significant introduction of construction traffic. Normal construction impacts on nearby neighbors - dust, noise, etc.	Site development will necessiate blasting of ledge. Significant introduction of construction traffic. Normal construction impacts on nearby neighbors - dust, noise, etc.	Site development will necessiate blasting of ledge. Significant introduction of construction traffic. Normal construction impacts on nearby neighbors - dust, noise, etc.	Site development will necessiate blasting of ledge. Significant introduction of construction traffic. Normal construction impacts on nearby neighbors - dust, noise, etc.	Site development will necessiate blasting of ledge. Significant introduction of construction traffic. Normal construction impacts on nearby neighbors - dust, noise, etc.	Site development will necessiate blasting of ledge. Significant introduction of construction traffic. Normal construction impacts on nearby neighbors - dust, noise, etc. Access/placement in back alleviates a bit	Normal construction impacts on nearby neighbors - dust, noise, etc.	Normal construction impacts on nearby neighbors - dust, noise, etc.	Remote location will limit construction impacts significantly.	Remote location will limit construction impacts significantly.	Some impact on direct abutters - but fairly limited.	All options will increase construction traffic in neighborhood although easy to mitigate including later start of school. 5=remote from neighbors, no blasting 4=closer to neighbors than 5, no blast 3=neighbors close, sep constr access, lim blast 2=neighbors close + blasting 1=lots of neighbors close + blasting
After Construction Effect on Traffic	Will probably be able to improve onsite circulation. No new traffic impacts	Should be able to improve onsite circulation. No new traffic impacts	Will probably be able to improve onsite circulation. No new traffic impacts	Should be able to improve onsite circulation. No new traffic impacts	Will probably be able to improve onsite circulation. No new traffic impacts	Should be able to improve onsite circulation. No new traffic impacts	Separate entrance will help compared with current situation, but 2x traffic incr w new school; baseline non-school Elm St traffic expected to increase with Mews and Crossroads	Separate entrance will help compared with current situation, but 2x traffic incr w new school; baseline non-school Elm St traffic expected to increase with Mews and Crossroads	Will increase traffic but on main road - likely need traffic light.	Will increase traffic but on main road - likely need traffic light.	Will increase traffic but on main road - likely need traffic light.	5=improve current traffic even more 4=improve current traffic 3=neutral, neg impacts can be mitigated 2=improve existing, but 2x volume neutralizes; +baseline area traffic likely to increase from nearby large developments
Site Planning	Very limited options for onsite traffic circulation. NSTAR has indicated they would grant a conditional license limiting back parcel options.	Same as 1a although Access Rd. will help significantly. Public Safety officials prefer location although require complete, paved access road around building.	Very limited options for onsite traffic circulation. NSTAR has indicated they would grant a conditional license limiting back parcel options.	Same as 1a although Access Rd. will help significantly. Public Safety officials prefer location although require complete, paved access road around building.	Very limited options for onsite traffic circulation. NSTAR has indicated they would grant a conditional license limiting back parcel options.	Same as 1a although Access Rd. will help significantly. Public Safety officials prefer location and require complete, paved access road around building.	Fairly tight site will limit options. Tennessee gas pipeline. Play areas in tact.	Fairly tight site will limit options. Tennessee gas pipeline. Lose a ballfield, would need replacement.	Pretty unlimited planning opportunities- take advantage of EMC park.	Pretty unlimited planning opportunities- take advantage of EMC park.	Fairly tight site will limit options. Long Access Rd. Single entry/exit.	5=ideal, open 4=2 ways in, field near bldg 3=somewhat constrained 2=constrained site+gas line 1=unworkable
Site Acquisition Complexity	None - although will need to sort out NSTAR electric line corridor	25 Ash St. acquisition, or if develop-led slightly more complex	None - although will need to sort out NSTAR electric line corridor	25 Ash St. acquisition, or if develop-led slightly more complex	None - although will need to sort out NSTAR electric line corridor	25 Ash St. acquisition, or if develop-led slightly more complex	None	None	Will need to purchase property	Will need to purchase property	Will need to purchase property. May need to discuss emergency access thorough private property.	5=no land acq required 4=straight land acq
Town Permitting: Construction & Conservation	Will need to engage Historic Commission on Center School redevelopment	Will need to engage Historic Commission on Center School redevelopment	Will need to engage Historic Commission on Center School redevelopment	Will need to engage Historic Commission on Center School redevelopment	Will need to engage Historic Commission on Center School redevelopment	Will need to engage Historic Commission on Center School redevelopment	Typical	Typical	Conservation Commission, potentially Park&Rec	Conservation Commission, potentially Park&Rec	Typical, potential Cons Comm	5=no unique permitting rqmts 4=Cons Comm or Historic District Comm (routine)
Long Range Planning / Town wide vision	Keeps school in Center. "School on the Common." Community character. Neighbors like having school. Leave other sites for other future town uses.	Keeps school in Center. "School on the Common." Community character. Neighbors like having school. Leave other sites for other future town uses.	Keeps school in Center. "School on the Common." Community character. Neighbors like having school. Leave other sites for other future town uses.	Keeps school in Center. "School on the Common." Community character. Neighbors like having school. Leave other sites for other future town uses.	Keeps school in Center. "School on the Common." Community character. Neighbors like having school. Leave other sites for other future town uses.	Keeps school in Center. "School on the Common." Community character. Neighbors like having school. Leave other sites for other future town uses.	Potential for becoming crowded area once CrossRoads and Mews are developed	Potential for becoming crowded area once CrossRoads and Mews are developed	Would prevent negative cost-of-community services from alternate site development. Potential bus storage on South.	Would prevent negative cost-of-community services from alternate site development. Potential bus storage on North.	Would prevent negative cost-of-community services from alternate site development	Potential to redevelop front of Center School for other town uses is equivalent for all scenarios.  5=CCS savings, potential bus parking, large space 3=neutral
School Future Growth and Flexibility	Minimal to no future growth on constrained site, but removes "what happens to Center School" question.	Minimal to no future growth on constrained site, but removes "what happens to Center School" question.	Minimal to no future growth on constrained site, but removes "what happens to Center School" question.	Minimal to no future growth on constrained site, but removes "what happens to Center School" question.	Minimal to no future growth on constrained site, but removes "what happens to Center School" question.	Minimal to no future growth on constrained site, but removes "what happens to Center School" question.	Very limited future growth; having 2 schools on site limits future on site expansion of either school.	Very limited future growth; having 2 schools on site limits future on site expansion of either school.	Great potential for future growth.	Great potential for future growth.	Future growth potential, some constraints.	5=maximum potential future growth 4=future growth potential, some constraints 2=limited space for future growth 1=minimal space for future growth
District Operations	Status Quo	Status Quo	Status Quo	Status Quo	Status quo + all new/energy effic/low maint	Status quo + all new/energy effic/low maint	Existing school campus offers some efficiency (single site for plowing, cleaning crew, etc)	Existing school campus offers some efficiency (single site for plowing, cleaning crew, etc).	New school campus	New school campus	New school campus	5=near exist schools, bus & cleaning savings 4=new/energy effic/low maint 3=neutral/status quo
Public Safety recommendation	Stated preference of Police and Fire.	Stated preference of Police and Fire.	Stated preference of Police and Fire.	Stated preference of Police and Fire.	Stated preference of Police and Fire.	Stated preference of Police and Fire.	Gas line	Gas line	travel time/potential congestion for emergency response	travel time/potential congestion for emergency response	travel time/potential congestion for emergency response	5=public safety officials preference 3=travel distance/congestion potential 1=public safety concerns